

Exercise 12 (a)

We set $A(x) \equiv (\forall y)(y < x \rightarrow B(y))$. We then want to show (C-IND):

$$(\forall x)(A(x) \rightarrow B(x)) \rightarrow (\forall x)B(x).$$

If we can show that $A(0)$ and $(\forall x)(A(x) \rightarrow A(\mathbf{S}(x)))$ we have $(\forall x)A(x)$ using (IND) and then it is easy to see that (C-IND) follows:

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} A(0) \wedge (\forall x)(A(x) \rightarrow A(\mathbf{S}(x))) \text{ IND} \\ \hline (\forall x)A(x) \end{array}}{A(x)} \forall E \quad \frac{\begin{array}{c} (\forall x)(A(x) \rightarrow B(x))^1 \\ \hline A(x) \rightarrow B(x) \end{array}}{B(x)} \rightarrow E$$

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} B(x) \\ \hline (\forall x)B(x) \end{array}}{(\forall x)B(x)} \forall I$$

$$\frac{(\forall x)B(x)}{(\forall x)(A(x) \rightarrow B(x)) \rightarrow (\forall x)B(x)} \rightarrow I, 1$$

Hence, we start by showing $A(0)$:

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} (\forall y)\neg y < 0 \\ \hline \neg y < 0 \end{array}}{y < 0^2} \forall E \rightarrow E$$

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \perp \\ \hline B(y) \end{array}}{y < 0 \rightarrow B(y)} \perp E$$

$$\frac{y < 0 \rightarrow B(y)}{A(0)} \forall I$$

Then we show the induction step (note that we are actually building a whole proof tree for (C-IND), which explains the use of assumption 1 in the following tree):

$\text{H2} \quad \frac{}{\forall y(y < \mathbf{S}(x) \leftrightarrow y = x \vee y < x)} \forall E$

 $\frac{(\forall y)(y < \mathbf{S}(x) \leftrightarrow y = x \vee y < x)}{y < \mathbf{S}(x) \leftrightarrow y = x \vee y < x} \forall E$

 $y < \mathbf{S}(x) \leftrightarrow y = x \vee y < x \quad y < \mathbf{S}(x)^4 \quad \frac{}{\leftrightarrow E}$

$\text{H4 with P=B} \quad \frac{}{(\forall y)(x = y \wedge B(x) \rightarrow B(y))} \forall E$

 $\frac{(\forall y)(x = y \wedge B(x) \rightarrow B(y))}{x = y \wedge B(x) \rightarrow B(y)} \forall E$

 $x = y^5 \quad \frac{}{x = y \wedge B(x)} \wedge I$

 $x = y \wedge B(x) \quad \frac{}{\rightarrow E}$

$\frac{(\forall x)(A(x) \rightarrow B(x))^1}{A(x) \rightarrow B(x)} \forall E$

 $A(x) \rightarrow B(x) \quad A(x)^3 \quad \frac{}{\rightarrow E}$

 $A(x)^3 \quad \frac{}{y < x^6} \quad \frac{y < x \rightarrow B(y)}{B(y)} \forall E$

 $y < x^6 \quad y < x \rightarrow B(y) \quad \frac{}{B(y)} \forall E, 5, 6$

$B(y)$

 $\frac{}{\rightarrow I, 4}$

 $y < \mathbf{S}(x) \rightarrow B(y) \quad \frac{}{\forall I}$

 $\frac{y < \mathbf{S}(x) \rightarrow B(y)}{A(\mathbf{S}(x))} \forall I$

 $A(\mathbf{S}(x)) \quad \frac{}{\rightarrow I, 3}$

 $A(x) \rightarrow A(\mathbf{S}(x)) \quad \frac{}{\forall I}$

 $(\forall x)(A(x) \rightarrow A(\mathbf{S}(x)))$

$\text{I2} \quad \frac{}{\forall I}$